PORTRAITS OF AMERICAN INDIAN women hang along a hallway on the third floor of the Ernest L. Wilkinson Student Center at Brigham Young University in Provo, Utah. The Miss Indian BYU photographs remain part of a past school tradition and a vestige of the Native American presence. The Miss Indian BYU Pageant began in 1967 during the Kimball Era, when Spencer W. Kimball directed Indian programs — particularly Indian Education — through the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (LDS) between the late 1950s and early 1980s. BYU alumni remember the pageant as a big event, and the winner’s “photo [was] taken and placed on the same floor as the Homecoming Queen.”

A Native American student organization called the Tribe of Many Feathers (TMF) hosted the Miss Indian BYU Pageant for twenty-three consecutive years before cancelling the pageant in 1990 following the termination of various LDS Indian programs. Native American students resurrected the pageant in 2001, crowning Vanessa Arviso (Navajo) as Miss Indian BYU 2001–2002. I won the last Miss Indian BYU Pageant in 2006, after TMF crowned a total of thirty-eight students during the tenure of the pageant. By focusing on the experiences and perspectives of past contestants, the Miss Indian BYU Pageant and its cancellations illuminate contestations over Indian identity and the waning Native American presence at a Mormon college that once boasted the largest Indian student body in any university.

Many Native American communities have embraced and appropriated pageants and “royal” title holders, although Europeans and Euro-Americans introduced and used Miss Indian pageants and images of Indian princesses as colonizing devices. Michael Campbell (Iroquois) worked for the BYU Multicultural Services after graduating from the university in 1986. “Two things were going on,” he recalled, “the Miss Indian Scholarship Pageant and Miss Indian BYU. Pageants were a big thing.” Miss Indian BYU exemplified the intertwining of Mormon-Indian relations, the broader development of Indian royalty, and Pan-Indian traditions. When the BYU pageant began in 1967, other Indian communities and organizations had already established Miss Indian pageants to select Native American women as leadership figures. Feminist movements and protests against female pageants such as Miss America also emerged when BYU students commenced their Miss Indian pageant.

The Miss Indian BYU Pageant reflected the strength of the Native American student community. The pageant faltered with decreasing Indian enrollment by the late 1980s. BYU officials simultaneously justified dissolving most Indian programs to integrate Native Americans with other multicultural students at BYU such as merging the American Indian Education Department with Multicultural Education in 1984. American Indians have persisted as distinct and sovereign peoples because of their ability to retain their collective identity, culture, and land. Indian identity rests on “a right to difference-in-equality” as Indians come from numerous tribes with their own respective histories, cultures, and communities. Pan-Indian traditions such
as pageantry brought peoples from different tribes together to collaborate, set standards for the pageant candidates, and accept a common representative. In the case of the 2007 pageant cancellation, the failed efforts to decide on appropriate qualifications of Miss Indian BYU revealed intertribal tensions as well as the waning support of an Indian student community.

Miss Indian BYU began when the university’s Indian student community created the program as a symbol of unity and presence. The pageant disappeared when that same circle fractured or otherwise lost interest. Jeanie Sekaquaptewa Groves (Hopi), Miss Indian BYU 1968, described the origins of the pageant: “I think it was new for the Indian program, but they had other contests on campus. So, I think it was bringing us to that same level as the other groups to have a Miss something to represent us. For us, it was showing that we were good, faithful members of the Church, that we had talents, and that we could get a college education.”

Intended to convey the ideal Indian student, Miss Indian BYU also served as a hostess for Indian Week, a celebration of Indian culture and heritage at the university. During Indian Week, TMF invited acclaimed guests to campus, including N. Scott Momaday, Chief Dan George, Miss Indian America, and LDS general authorities. Former Miss Indian BYUs outlined the following four responsibilities that they held: Maintain and share Native American traditions and culture; aid Native Americans to adjust to changing times; be an example to students; and provide service and create service opportunities for students.

Significant differences distinguish Miss Indian pageants, especially the Miss Indian BYU Pageant, from other pageants and beauty contests. According to scholar Wendy Kozol, Miss Indian pageant winners must demonstrate “Indian adaptability to modern life.” The judges of the Miss Indian BYU Pageant assessed the contestants’ knowledge of their Indian heritage and their ability to uphold their values and traditions. The winner took on various identities and served as an ambassador where certain communities intersected. The networks she represented included BYU, LDS membership, and First Nations. Janice White Clemmer (Wasco-Shawnee-Delaware) worked with BYU’s Native American Studies and multicultural programs in the 1980s. Clemmer was a judge at four Miss Indian BYU pageants and recalled that TMF intended the pageant to “celebrate young American Indian womanhood, never any swimsuit competition, never about beauty in the Barbie-doll sense or about Miss USA, never put down if overweight, recognized different girls.” Clemmer elaborated on the criteria for judging Miss Indian BYU contestants. She considered how the contestants looked in their regalia, but she focused on their “tribal knowledge” and “LDS standards.” She believed that Miss Indian BYU “demonstrates best of both worlds, of all worlds . . . someone who
represented her tribe, other tribes, school, and gospel.” Miss Indian BYU 2004–2005, Jordan Zendejas (Omaha), echoed Clemmer’s expectations that the winner “represents the Church, Tribe, Natives, and herself.”

Vickie Bird Sanders (Mandan-Gros Ventre-Hidatsa), Miss Indian BYU 1971–1972, remembered how the pageant covered a week of preparations, including interviews with judges, showcases of traditional and modern talents, and special banquets before the actual pageant event. Pitted against seven other competitors, the judges assessed Sanders’s presence in traditional regalia and her vast knowledge of the seventy-seven tribes represented at BYU. Contestants needed to be familiar with their tribal language, culture, reservation, and current government policies. The judges evaluated the contestants’ interviews, public speaking, presentation, and their modern and traditional talents.

The pageant and role of Miss Indian BYU diminished after the height of the Kimball Era in the 1970s. While many young American Indians throughout the country became involved in the American Indian Movement (AIM), Kimball identified Indians as “Lamanite” descendants and spearheaded a “Lamanite Cause” by directing LDS Indian initiatives such as the Indian Student Placement Program. Some scholars and people have interpreted the efforts of the “Lamanite Cause” as forms of racialization and colonialism. Some BYU Indian students, however, embraced Kimball’s words as empowering in the late twentieth century. They appropriated the Lamanite identity as a form of Indian pride, using “Lamanite” as a vehicle of their unity and call for change instead of joining AIM. Native Americans who identified themselves as Lamanites turned to prophecies in LDS scripture that foretold how “the Lamanites shall blossom as the rose.” As part of their convictions, they would receive the promises ascribed to their lineage by fulfilling their mission to serve the Lord and build His kingdom on earth.

During the pinnacle of the Kimball Era in 1970, BYU claimed the largest Indian population of any American university with approximately 600 students. The former BYU yearbook, Banyan, explained that many Indian students came from the placement program and received “special consideration for admission.” A LDS Native American community developed as the Indians in Placement were baptized, studied at BYU, and continued to follow the
LDS faith throughout their lives. Miss Indian BYU represented this intertribal community by appearing at gatherings such as the BYU Powwow, Lamanite firesides, and Indian Week.

During the early years of the pageant, Miss Indian BYU faced the influences and tensions of the Civil Rights Movement. She was primarily a spokesperson for TMF, which provided a platform for LDS Native Americans to respond to the major transitions and current events involving race relations. According to the BYU Indian student newspaper in 1971, TMF held open forums “for individuals to express their ideas and suggestions concerning Indian affairs on and off campus.” Native American students discussed issues such as balancing their image as “college students, as Mormon Indians, as modern contemporary Indians, or as Future Indian leaders.” They also considered their “relationship with various National Indian Organizations.” Nora Mae Begay (Navajo) served as Miss Indian BYU 1970–1971 and Miss Indian America XVIII the following year. As a public figure, Indian activists criticized Begay for being a “product” of the placement program and a poor representative of “the true Indian of today.” Begay claimed, however, “‘that cooperation and unity between the different people of the world as well as among the many Indian tribes will result in a better future for all of us.’” Begay served as a bridge between the diverging sects of American Indians that each supported their own means of Indian civil rights and progress.

Some Indian activists criticized BYU students like Begay and considered Mormon Native Americans as “apples” (“red on the outside, white on the inside”), and they protested against the LDS programs. The Church and BYU officials in turn disapproved of the Red Power movement, and they stifled such activism on campus. BYU President Ernest Wilkinson and other school officials reprimanded the students who showed inappropriate behavior and conduct. Phillip Smith served as TMF President when Begay was
Miss Indian BYU in 1970. Wilkinson chided Smith on more than one occasion for resembling an “activist” and associating with the National Indian Youth Council. Wilkinson disapproved of Smith’s conduct during a BYU football game against San Diego State University when Smith and other students wore red arm bands to protest San Diego State’s exclusion of Native American athletes. Smith was mimicking similar protests against BYU, involving students who wore black arm bands to reproach BYU for excluding African Americans. Smith represented the different ways that BYU students engaged with the Civil Rights Movement despite the directives of school and church leaders. Some LDS Native Americans accepted the stance of the church on such affairs as Miss Indian BYU who hoped to incite change through example, service, and “cooperation and unity.”

American Indians continued to scrutinize Miss Indian BYU after Begay’s reign, especially those who failed to reconcile Mormon and Indian relations. Vickie Sanders recalled the tensions between AIM activists and BYU Indian students, describing how some Indians taunted her and other students when they traveled to perform with the dance groups, Lamanitettes and Lamanite Generation. The activists disapproved of their performance outfits, claiming that the attire was indecent and not Indian. Sanders admitted that AIM was a “big struggle” for her as Miss Indian BYU: “They weren’t very fond of the LDS Church and so anyone associated with BYU was kind of approached in negative ways so I think those were the difficult times that I had, trying to be a representative, but yet they would refer to me as ‘You’re not a real Indian. You’re just an apple Indian.’” Sanders reasserted her identity as a LDS Native American and BYU ambassador whenever people challenged her. She remembered, “So many of them took pride in ‘why don’t you wear something that identifies you as native? Why don’t you wear a feather in your hair?’” She would respond, “That to me is not what needs to set me apart from who I am. I don’t need to grow my hair long or wear it in braids or wear a feather or wear my Indian dress to show people that I’m proud of who I am.” She found pride in BYU and claimed, “I tried [Miss Indian BYU] because everything it was all about is what I believe in.” Sanders treasured her experience as Miss Indian BYU and enjoyed sharing her culture with others, although some questioned her Indian identity and contested the compatibility of being Indian and Mormon.
During the reigns of Begay and Sanders, TMF facilitated major social activities and cultural exchange for both Indians as well as the BYU student body in general. The club sponsored Indian dance programs as early as 1959. Robert F. William, an advisor to Indian students in the BYU Indian Education Program, recommended that the dance program become an annual event in 1961, since it could “be a source of pride and satisfaction to the Indian students on campus” and raise money for the club and the student performers. TMF continued to host “culturally oriented Indian programs” and provide “personal insight and expressions regarding what might be termed as ‘Indian-ness’” through events such as Indian Week, the Miss Indian BYU Pageant, and culture shows for Boy and Cub Scout troops, schools, and Relief Society groups. An annual BYU powwow began in 1982 as part of the Indian Week festivities, which became known as the Harold Cedartree Powwow. Miss Indian BYU would appear among the “royalty” and announce the giveaways, acknowledging people who had contributed to the Indian Week events.

Perceptions of American Indian preference at BYU became so evident that many school affiliates started to accuse the university of “favoring American Indians over other racial minority groups.” They criticized any program that concentrated specifically on Indians, including “recruitment, academic offerings, financial aid, work-study programs, academic counseling, The Eagle’s Eye Indian student newspaper, the Tribe of Many Feathers Club, Miss Indian BYU, Indian Week, and even the Native American Studies program.” Before the 1990s, BYU paid special attention to a substantial Indian student body, inevitably drawing complaints from other group representatives.

The 1990s marked a new period of “integration” at BYU, with most of the Indian programs and community dissolving and becoming integrated with other multicultural programs. The dawn of the twenty-first century marked the end of the placement program, brought renewed attacks on affirmative action, witnessed the growth of tribal colleges, and saw decreased Mormon emphasis on American Indians. The growth and global expansion of the LDS Church weakened the BYU Native American community as well. Some remaining Indian students appreci-
ated the changes within the university’s Indian programs; Jordan Zen-dejas, for example, declared, “We made the transition, more established, showing by involving other cultures too; whereas, it was focused on Indians only before.” Students now celebrate “Heritage Week,” which the Multicultural Student Services sponsors as a variety of cultural events including Fiesta, Luau, and the Cedartree Powwow.

As more Indian programs dissolved, BYU’s enthusiasm towards pageants drastically decreased. The Belle of the Y, Homecoming Queen, and Miss Indian BYU were all indefinitely cancelled by 1990. Summer McCombs, one of the contestants in the 2002 Miss Indian BYU Pageant, believed that the discontinuance of the Homecoming Queen designation in 1987 discouraged students from participating in the Miss Indian pageant. The pageant started again in 2001, but Miss Indian BYU returned to a smaller and less engaged Indian community.

In 2007, the BYU Native American Studies website reported that the Indian student population was a mere one-third of its 1970s’ peak of about 600 individuals. TMF no longer operated an intricate system of presidency roles, responsibilities, and functions, but the club persevered after the disintegration of many other Indian programs. Participation became minimal compared to previous decades, but TMF remained active and provided an outlet for Indian students. Miss Indian BYU offered some consistency to the Indian community between 2001 and 2007, as title-holders followed the examples of their predecessors. Monika Brown Crowfoot (Navajo), Miss Indian BYU 2002–2003, claimed, “The purpose [of the Miss Indian BYU Pageant] is just service.” She believed that contestants should realize that they can still serve, be an example, and bear their testimony of the LDS faith with or without the crown.

Although TMF did not specify a required number of service hours for pageant contestants, Crowfoot volunteered by helping mentally disabled children at a local elementary school. She recognized the need for exemplary figures among American Indian children and believed that...

LDS Church President Spencer W. Kimball being presented with an elk skin emblazoned with the lyrics of the song “Go, My Son,” by Miss Indian BYU 1975 Millie Cody. The song was written by two Native American BYU students, Arlene Nofchissey Williams and Carnes Burson. Courtesy L. Tom Perry Special Collections, University Archives, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University.
cultural exchange had to “go both ways.” One of her goals as Miss Indian BYU was to introduce different cultures to American Indian children. She set learning and sharing cultures as her platform for the pageant, hoping that people could learn from one another and share a common heritage as children of the same spiritual father. As a keynote speaker at several LDS youth conferences on the Navajo reservation, Crowfoot encouraged Indian youth to remain faithful to their LDS values. She spoke to Navajo youth at the LDS Chinle Stake Youth Conference in Arizona, emphasizing the importance of adhering to standards such as modesty and the law of chastity. Indian students such as Crowfoot upheld many of the same roles as Miss Indian BYU during earlier reigns.

In the twenty-first century, Miss Indian BYU title-holders struggled to be accepted as an Indian representative like some of their predecessors during the Kimball Era. Jordan Zendejas visited public schools in contemporary attire such as a pantsuit to show children that she lived a modern lifestyle like them. Adult supervisors at some schools complained that she did not “look Indian,” because she did not wear an “Indian costume.” She remembered that “there would be people who think, ‘You’re not Indian enough. You don’t look Indian enough. Do you take being Indian seriously?’” Zendejas contested the expected image of an Indian princess by refusing to appear in traditional regalia for her presentations. In 2007, an anonymous online writer posted on “Mormon Discussions” that “Miss Indian BYU is becoming white and delightful!” The author of the post satirized the belief of some Mormons that Indians would become “a white and delightful people” as Lamanite descendants. The posts criticized Miss Indian BYU for becoming more “white” and less “Indian” over time, rekindling historical contentions between Mormons and Indians. The last three Miss Indian BYUs had a fair complexion and were part white. The post demonstrated externalized constructs of race and ethnicity, while challenging the Indianness of Miss Indian BYU.

Questions of Indianness surfaced in 2006 and 2007 during debates over the role of Miss Indian BYU and pageant qualifications. As Miss Indian BYU, I struggled to meet the expectations of the TMF adviser and council that the adviser’s daughter presided over. The adviser insisted that I participate in the BYU performance group for Latin Americans, Polynesians, and Native Americans — known as Living Legends (the former Lamanite Generation) — rather than the local nonprofit organization Remember Our Culture (ROC). Michael and Lluvia Campbell founded ROC, a multicultural performance ensemble open to all college students, in 2001 after leaving the BYU Multicultural Student Services (MSS). When the TMF council threatened to revoke my title as Miss Indian BYU if I did not quit ROC, Lluvia Campbell explained how the BYU MSS often tried to obstruct their program and encouraged me.
to continue with ROC, affirming that, “You will always be an Indian princess.” The adviser and council saw Living Legends as a legitimate program for Native Americans unlike ROC.

Seven female students submitted applications for the 2007 Miss Indian BYU Pageant. TMF had failed to update the deadline of the application on their webpage, and most applicants did not meet the qualification standards, although the council waived the requirements in most cases. Some of the prerequisites included completing 50 hours of community service, being an active member in TMF, and possessing a Certificate of Indian Blood (CIB). One applicant who had been disenrolled by her tribe did not have a current CIB, and the TMF council ruled to disqualify her only after she turned in her application late. The council cancelled the pageant when the same applicant appealed the decision two weeks before the scheduled event. According to the school newspaper, “The president and vice president of the club said not enough applicants met the qualifications in order for them to host a pageant.”

A small group of students in the council made the decision that ended a BYU tradition, but no Indian student community protested and showed interest in the affair. Only a handful of students exhibited any discontent, including some of the applicants who met with the council and spoke to local news reporters about the incident. The TMF adviser admitted to local news representa-tives that, “[The TMF Council] did get some negative feedback from people and it brought feelings of frustration and probably even fear, and to me, that is going overboard.”

Government standards of Indian blood quantum and debates over expectations of contemporary Indian students disqualified the applicants.

In 2008, Navajo student Jeremy Begay compared the Indian student body of the Kimball era to that of the integration period. His parents went to BYU in the 1970s, and they told him how the school had “a huge Indian program, a monstrous Indian program, and lots of Native Americans here. . . . They call it the good old days.” Begay was disappointed to find few Indian students who related to each other and noticed that
the BYU “Native American program is not even half as good as it was even five years ago.” Concerning his fellow Indian students, he claimed, “None of them had a common bond other than skin color.” Begay and others were the children of the “Lamanite Generation” that established a presence at BYU in the late twentieth century. This second Indian generation, however, discovered a disconnected Indian student body at BYU that shares some common physiognomy but lacks a strong sense of community.

In 2007, BYU President Cecil O. Samuelson was asked about his stance on Native American issues and proclaimed that, “BYU encourages inclusion.” This inclusion, however, ironically excludes Native Americans. The university once had a solid infrastructure of Indian education and community. The failure of the Miss Indian BYU Pageant in 2007 signaled the decline of Indian presence at BYU. Opportunities to encourage Indian education and professional development faltered after the 1980s, and the hallway of Miss Indian BYU portraits serves as the only reminder of the pageant and past Indian presence. The portraits are not simple images of Indian princesses. The frames that adorn the wall evoke visual manifestations of contested indigeneity and emblemize the constant mutability of human identity through the specific examples of individual Miss Indian BYUs. The women all wear beaded crowns with “B.Y.U.” on the front, marking them as Indian “royalty” connected to the intertwined histories of Mormon, Indian, and Lamanite communities.

Notes

6. Campbell, interview. The Miss Indian Scholarship Pageant was not organized by BYU but was an external program.


10. I refer to Homi Bhabha’s definition of “a right to difference-in-equality” based on Etienne Balibar’s work, which “does not require the restoration of an original [or essentialist] cultural or group identity; nor does it consider equality to be a neutralization of differences in the name of the ‘universality’ of rights where implementation is often subject to ideological and institutional definitions of what counts as ‘human’ in any specific cultural or political context.” See Homi Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (New York: Routledge Classics, 2004), xvii.

11. Jeanie Groves, interview by author, Orem, Utah, February 12, 2008, transcript, LDS Native American Oral History Collection (hereafter cited as LDS NAOH), Brigham Young University Harold B. Lee Library, Provo, Utah (hereafter cited as HBLL). The winner of the pageant would often receive a grant for their college expenses at BYU, which encouraged the contestants to pursue their education.

12. Sunny [Evangelie] Dooley (Navajo), Miss Indian BYU 1985–1986, remarked that Miss Indian BYU “was supposed to exemplify good moral character for the Native students” especially during Indian Week. Sunny Dooley, interview by author, April 4, 2007, telephone communication.


16. The qualifications for Miss Indian BYU, however, never required that she be a member of the LDS church. She was expected to live according to LDS standards and be interviewed by a LDS bishop or equivalent leader as are all BYU students for admittance to the university.

17. Clemmer, interview.


22. Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, *Doctrine and Covenants of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. The Pearl of Great Price* (Salt Lake City, Utah: Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1991), 90.


24. Banyan (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University, 1971), 239.


27. Phillip Lee Smith, interview by
FARINA KING. _Bilagáanaa niliigo’ dóó Kiyaa’áanii yásh’chíín. Bilagáanaa dabicheii dóó Tsinaajinii dabinálí. Áköt’eego diné asdzá?á? nilí?._ Farina King is “Bilagáanaa” (Euro-American), born for “Kiyaa’áanii” (the Towering House Clan) of the Diné (Navajo). Her maternal grandfather was Euro-American, and her paternal grandfather was “Tsinaajinii” (Black-streaked Woods People Clan) of the Diné. In this way, she is a Navajo woman. She is a graduate student in the U.S. History PhD program at Arizona State University. She received her M.A. in African History from the University of Wisconsin and a B.A. from Brigham Young University with a double major in History history and French Studies. King has written and presented about indigenous Mormon experiences in the twentieth century, drawing from some interviews that she conducted for the LDS Native American Oral History Project at BYU. Her doctoral research traces the changes in Navajo educational experiences through the twentieth century. She was the last Miss Indian BYU crowned in 2006. King is also a dedicated wife and mother.